



Judges Scoring Sheet

2017-2018 APICS Case Competition

Judge ID		Team ID	
----------	--	---------	--

	Team score	Points Available
Report and Presentation		
Overall Style and Impression of Report Slides		10
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appropriate visualization and structure of data/information 		5
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Deck created to a professional standard (e.g. formatting) 		5
Overall Quality of Team Presentation (verbal delivery, flow, and professionalism)		10
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Team's verbal delivery and professionalism 		5
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Flow of presentation and consistency of message across the team 		5
Summary Slides and Understanding of Problem		
Executive Summary Slide Single slide after title slide, summarize high-level, major points, situation and solution		5
Understanding of Problem Statement Concise description of situation, challenges/opportunities and company needs		10
Quality of Assumptions and Justification States the team's questions, the assumptions made, and their justifications		10
Conclusions Single slide prior to final thank you slide, summary of major findings and recommendations		10
Solution Process and Content		
Industry Assessment		5
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear statement around the status and direction of the challenges/opportunities of the company's industry, use of relevant data points to explain the big picture (4-5 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clear statement with slightly unbalanced analysis between challenges/opportunities, use of some good data points to support the statement (2-3 pts) 		



Competitive Position within the Supply Chain		5
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structured assessment of company's place in the supply chain and relationship with suppliers and customers (4-5 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Less organized assessment on company's place in the supply chain and less comprehensive assessment on the relationship with suppliers and customers (2-3 pts) 		
Network Design and Geographic Considerations		10
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structured, data-supported assessment for the company's supply chain network, developed feasible and fact-based plan with consideration of geographic constraints or opportunities (8-10 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Basic assessment with insufficient use of data or given information, with acceptable level of misinterpretation of the case (4-7 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assessment lacks basic structure, fundamental errors in modelling/interpretation of the case (1-3 pts) 		
Inventory and Flow Planning		10
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structured, data-supported analysis and plan for transportation and storage of goods throughout the network (8-10 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Basic assessment with insufficient use of data or given information, with acceptable level of misinterpretation of the case (4-7 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assessment lacks basic structure, fundamental errors in modelling/interpretation of the case (1-3 pts) 		
Customer Service Level Tradeoffs		10
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structured, data-supported analysis around tradeoffs between service levels and costs of providing those service levels (8-10 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Basic assessment with insufficient use of data or given information, with acceptable level of misinterpretation of the case (1-7 pts) 		
Technology Considerations		5
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Creative and relevant capabilities recommended by team and justification of value vs. cost (4-5 pts) 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Capabilities were recommended by team but lacked clear explanation or cost considerations (1-3 pts) 		



Extra Credit Points for Creativity or Innovation		
Creative section or solution developed with strong argument (0-3 points)		3

Summary Judges Comments [NOTE: this open-ended feedback to be shared with teams]

Strongest Aspects of Solution/Presentation	Weakest Part of the Solution/Presentation